

Building a Wellbeing Framework Fit for the Future

WEAll Scotland's response to the Scottish Government's consultation on review of the National Outcomes and National Performance Framework - June 2023

WEAll Scotland is the Scottish Hub of the Wellbeing Economy Alliance, a collaboration of organisations and individuals working to redesign our economy to put people and planet first.

A Wellbeing Economy is an economy designed to deliver good lives on a healthy planet. A successful Wellbeing Economy in Scotland would have to provide for the following five fundamental needs:

- **Purpose:** The collective wellbeing of people and planet is the driving goal behind decision-making. Economic activities and behaviours that contribute to this purpose are valued, and our institutions serve the common good.
- **Dignity:** Everyone has enough to live in comfort, safety and happiness. Poverty becomes a thing of the past.
- **Nature:** The economy operates well within planetary boundaries, enabling ecosystems to regenerate to provide a restored and safe natural world for all life.
- **Fairness:** The economy is designed to ensure a just distribution of income, wealth, power and time. Inequalities are reduced to a small fraction of today's levels.
- **Participation:** The shape of the economy is determined by people's active voices and is locally rooted. People participate in the decisions that affect their lives, whether it is in their countries, communities, or workplaces. Participatory processes are designed to hear the voices of marginalised and oppressed groups.

A robust wellbeing framework and measurements that captures this vision is an essential foundation for a Wellbeing Economy and can catalyse the wider transformation that is required across our economy. In creating the National Outcomes and the National Performance Framework (NPF) and in being a founding member of the Wellbeing Economy Government's partnership, Scotland has been playing a leading role in the Wellbeing Economy movement. Many of our members and peers around the world look to Scotland for leadership, often envious of our NPF.

But a framework is only as good as the impact it has on decision making and the sense of ownership in its citizens that it is based on. On both counts we believe the National Outcomes and NPF in their current form are falling well short of their potential. In the following submission we are setting out proposals for transforming the National Outcomes and NPF into a world-leading wellbeing framework that is embedded throughout decision making by public bodies and beyond.

Summary

1 - Changes to the current set of National Outcomes

1. Revise the “Economy” Outcome to make explicit that our economy should serve the purpose of delivering good lives for all people and protect the health of our planet in a way that prioritises collaboration and care over competition and GDP growth.
2. Revise the “Fair Work and Business” Outcome to include the need for more purposeful businesses and social enterprise and a more diverse landscape of business ownership.
3. Revise the “Poverty” Outcome to ensure that the eradication of poverty is the goal.
4. Revise the “Environment” Outcome to recognise that our society is part of and dependent on nature and highlight our international responsibilities resulting from historical impacts.

2 - Proposed new National Outcomes

5. Include a new National Outcome on care to value and prioritise the crucial role that care work in all its forms plays for our collective wellbeing.
6. Include a new National Outcome on democracy to highlight the importance of robust democratic processes, both as a key outcome in itself and to support the delivery of the other Outcomes.

3 - Proposed changes to the wider National Performance Framework (NPF)

7. Change the name of the NPF to become Scotland’s Wellbeing Framework.
8. Remove references to “growth” from the purpose of the framework and strengthen the references to sustainability.
9. Improve presentation and clarity of the set of indicators to make it easier to judge progress.
10. Improve the way that poverty is understood and measured.

4 - Proposals for making the NPF more impactful

11. Strengthen duties to promote National Outcomes through delivering the promised Wellbeing & Sustainable Development Bill and provide clear guidance for implementation.
12. Invest in a comprehensive participatory and deliberative process to increase legitimacy and ownership of the NPF across Scotland.
13. Introduce Wellbeing Budgeting to ensure that spending is aligned with the National Outcomes.
14. Create a Wellbeing & Future Generations Commissioner to support the implementation and scrutiny of the National Outcomes and NPF.

1- Changes to the current set of National Outcomes

1-1 Proposed changes to the “Economy” outcome

Current outcome: ***We have a globally competitive, entrepreneurial, inclusive and sustainable economy.*** *We recognise that a strong, competitive economy is essential to supporting jobs, incomes and our quality of life. We also know that our economy must be environmentally sustainable, inclusive and benefit all our people and communities. Through this outcome we will create the conditions through which to achieve these commitments alongside economic growth.*

Revised outcome proposed by WEAll Scotland: ***We have an entrepreneurial, inclusive and sustainable wellbeing economy that is in service of delivering good lives for all people and that protects the health of our planet.*** *We recognise that a strong, collaborative and caring economy is essential to supporting jobs, incomes and our quality of life. We also know that our economy must be fair, participatory and ensure that everyone has enough to live in dignity while operating within planetary boundaries. We aim to achieve these commitments through better targeting economic growth in the areas that will provide fairer economic outcomes and scaling down economic activities that support poor economic, social and environmental outcomes.*

Why we are proposing these revisions:

- Our current economy is not delivering good living standards for all people across Scotland and is exacerbating environmental breakdown. Too many people in Scotland are living in cold homes, skipping meals and falling behind on rent¹ while Scotland's 20 richest families own more wealth than 30 percent of the poorest citizens combined.² Life expectancy for the 20% of Scotland's population on the lowest incomes is falling.³ At the same time, there are growing fears that Scotland's legal emission targets will be missed, and the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change recently warned that the world faces a "brief and rapidly closing window to secure a liveable future".⁴
- We consider it important that the “Economy” outcome makes it explicit that we need an economy in which commercial activities and entrepreneurialism serve the purpose of addressing these challenges and serve people and planet. This is captured in the vision of a Wellbeing Economy, which has widespread support throughout civil society in Scotland⁵ and the wider public⁶.
- In order to build such an economy also requires a more nuanced approach to the growth of Gross Domestic Product (GDP) as a societal goal, because GDP does not take into account our quality of life and it does not address the increasing damage this model does to the natural world.^{7,8,9} As a result the UK and Scottish Governments are spending billions of pounds each year on failure demands that could be avoided in a better designed economy.^{10,11} We therefore propose to explicitly recognise in the “Economy” outcome that, while we need to grow some areas of economic activity, we also need to scale down economic activities that do not align with the purpose of supporting good lives and collective wellbeing on a healthy planet. This is necessary to ensure that we are moving from an extractive towards a regenerative economy that uses less energy and natural resources and operates well within planetary boundaries.
- We consider that for the creation of a successful economy the values of collaboration and care are more important than competitiveness. There is evidence that the design of

our current economy and its focus on competition is a key driver of poor economic, social and environmental outcomes.^{12,13}

1-2 Proposed changes to “Fair Work and Business” outcome

Current outcome: ***We have thriving and innovative businesses with quality jobs and fair work for everyone.*** Investing in the skills and creativity of our workforce, protecting workers rights and providing decent working conditions is the right thing to do. It also makes our economy more stable, productive and efficient. In this outcome we will provide the necessary legislative and operational structures to achieve this.

Revised outcome proposed by WEAll Scotland: ***We have thriving, purposeful and democratic businesses with diverse ownership models providing quality jobs and fair work.*** Business purpose is to provide profitable solutions to the problems of people and planet not to profit from creating problems from either. Investing in the skills and creativity of our workforce, protecting workers rights and providing decent working conditions is the right thing to do. It also makes our economy more stable, productive and efficient. In this outcome we will provide the necessary legislative and operational structures that support the flourishing of purposeful businesses and social enterprises with democratic ownership models.

Why we are proposing these changes:

- We consider it important to include an explicit reference to “business purpose” in the outcome. In order to create an economy in Scotland that can provide good lives for all on a healthy planet requires that we leverage all the creativity, innovation and passion that businesses can bring to the table. This is in line with the recommendations by the Business Purpose Commission, which also provides the definition of business purpose “to provide profitable solutions to the problems of people and planet not to profit from creating problems from either”.¹⁴
- We also propose to explicitly recognise the need for a more diverse landscape of ownership in the economy, with more businesses that are owned by communities, the public, municipalities, and employees as well as more cooperative businesses. Creating such a more diverse landscape is a key pillar of Community Wealth Building¹⁵ and the Wellbeing Economy, because such businesses contribute to a fairer distribution of wealth in our communities and in Scotland.

1-3 Proposed changes to the “Poverty” outcome

Current outcome: ***We tackle poverty by sharing opportunities, wealth and power more equally.*** Scotland is a wealthy country and we have the resources, ability and commitment to provide a decent life for all our people. Through this outcome we will work together across political parties and sectors to identify and address the root causes of disadvantage and set in place the actions to eradicate poverty for good.

Revised outcome proposed by WEAll Scotland: ***We eradicate poverty by sharing opportunities, wealth and power more equally.*** Scotland is a wealthy country and we have the resources, ability and commitment to provide a decent life for all our people. Through this outcome we will work together across political parties and sectors, guided by the lived experience of those living in poverty, to identify and address the root causes of disadvantage and set in place the actions to eradicate poverty for good.

Why we are proposing these changes:

- We propose to replace “tackle” in the first sentence with “eradicate”, because we do not consider any remaining poverty to be acceptable in the Scotland that we want to see. This change also makes it consistent with the remainder of the text in the outcome.
- We also consider it very important that the outcome explicitly highlights that we can only end poverty if we put the people living in poverty at the heart of decision making.

1-4 Proposed changes to the “Environment” outcome

Current outcome: ***We value, enjoy, protect and enhance our natural environment.*** *Scotland is a beautiful country and we are blessed with abundant natural resources and architecture to rival the best in the world. Through this Outcome we recognise that it is our duty to protect and enhance these assets as essential to our economy, culture, way of life and the wellbeing of future generations.*

Revised outcome proposed by WEAll Scotland: ***We value, enjoy, protect and enhance our natural environment in Scotland and beyond.*** *Scotland is a beautiful country and we have the natural resources and architecture to rival the best in the world. Through this Outcome we recognise that it is our duty to protect and enhance these assets as essential to our economy, culture, way of life and the wellbeing of future generations. We recognise that this duty extends to our environmental impacts beyond the borders of Scotland and reflects our responsibility to the international community for our historical environmental impacts.*

Why we are proposing these changes:

- Given the interconnected nature of our global society and economy we consider it important that the “Environment” Outcome does not only focus on the natural environment in Scotland, but also recognises the big impacts that our economy and lifestyles have beyond the boundaries of Scotland. For example, more than half of Scotland’s carbon footprint is now produced outside of Scotland’s borders.¹⁶
- We also consider it important to recognise Scotland’s responsibility to the international community for the historical environmental impacts that have arisen from Scotland and the UK being one of the longest-industrialised countries.

2 – New National Outcomes to be included in the National Performance Framework

2-1 Include a dedicated new National Outcome on Care

Why do we need a new National Outcome on care?

We support the call by the A Scotland that Cares campaign to include a dedicated, new National Outcome that recognises the importance for care and the contribution of carers.

Everyone needs care at some point in their life and care work in all its forms provides the foundation for our wellbeing. But care work is systematically undervalued in our economy that is focused on GDP growth and productivity. We need to redesign our economy so that care for people and planet becomes the foundation and guiding principles for all economic decision-making. By prioritising and investing in care work such an economy would have

positive impacts on the wellbeing of people across Scotland, it would reduce different forms of gender inequality and could create meaningful, well-paid and low-carbon jobs.

We believe that the lack of a dedicated National Outcome on care is an important barrier to redesigning our economy in such a way. Creating a new National Outcome on care would provide an important step in building a Wellbeing Economy in which care would be prioritised and would receive the valuation and investment that is needed.

What should a National Outcome on Care look like?

We agree with the definition of the new National Outcome as proposed by the 'A Scotland that Cares' campaign and academics at the University of the West of Scotland:

'We fully value and invest in those experiencing care and all those providing it'.

Please see Appendix 1 for a more detailed justification for a new National Outcome on care including references to relevant evidence and suggestions for indicators.

2-2 Include new National Outcome on democracy and and the protection of civic space

Why do we need a new National Outcome on democracy and the protection of civic space?

In its current form the National Outcomes and the wider NPF do not include any references to the values of democracy and participation beyond the value to act in an open and transparent way. We consider that this is a major omission and a big gap in the vision of the Scotland that we want to see.

Firstly, ensuring that Scotland has a thriving democracy that enables everyone to participate in civic life and influence the decisions that affect is an important ingredient for a successful Scotland and collective wellbeing in its own right. "Participation" is one of the five important needs that a Wellbeing Economy needs to deliver as outlined by a joint statement supported by more than 100 civil society leaders⁵ and the need for democracy is a common theme in the growing number of wellbeing frameworks proposed around the world.¹⁷

Secondly, robust democratic values and structures are important for delivering the other National Outcomes and also need to be a key feature of the development of the outcomes itself. The NPF and the National Outcomes are currently missing a clear description of how the outcomes will be delivered and who has to be involved in the process. We therefore propose to include a new National Outcome that explicitly highlights the need for democracy and the protection of civic space.

What could such an outcome look like?

We propose the following wording for the new outcome: *"We have a thriving democracy and civic space enabling everyone to have a say in the decisions that affect them."*

In the further elaboration of the outcome and the development of indicators we consider it important to consider the following aspects:

- an emphasis to include the voices of those that are seldom heard
- a recognition that a thriving democracy requires opportunities for participation to be accompanied with the sharing of power

3 – Changes to the National Performance Framework beyond the National Outcomes

3-1 Proposed changes to the name of the NPF

We believe that the name of the framework as ‘National Performance Framework’ is a barrier for the framework and the National Outcomes to be more deeply embedded in decision-making in Scotland. We would therefore propose to change the name to ‘Scotland’s Wellbeing Framework’ to make the purpose of the framework clearer and facilitate better engagement with the framework, in the public sector and beyond.

3-2 Proposed changes to the ‘Purpose’ Section of the NPF

Remove the reference to growth from the NPF’s purpose

We strongly believe that the reference to “growth”, which is likely to be interpreted as referring to economic growth as measured by GDP, needs to be removed from the ‘purpose’ section of the National Performance Framework. The purpose at the heart of the NPF should reflect the most fundamental aims and values of Scottish society. We believe that GDP growth should not be included as part of these fundamental aims and values for the following reasons:

- It is widely accepted that GDP in itself is not a suitable measure of wellbeing or progress.¹⁸ It does not distinguish between economic activities that enhance collective wellbeing and our natural environment and economic activities that harm people and planet. It excludes many activities essential for wellbeing, such as unpaid care work, and does not take into account whether our income and wealth are distributed fairly. We therefore consider that GDP growth does not have a place in the fundamental aims and values for the Scotland that we want to create. This is supported by the recommendations of Scotland’s Climate Assembly to “reframe the national focus and vision for Scotland’s future away from economic growth and Gross Domestic Product (GDP)”.¹⁹
- In addition, there is strong evidence that GDP growth is a key driver of environmental breakdown, for example by causing increases in greenhouse gas emissions, resource and energy use and accelerating biodiversity loss.^{20,21,22} Including growth in the purpose of the NPF therefore puts it into direct conflict with the other aims to ensure sustainability and the wellbeing of people living in Scotland, especially in the future.

Strengthen the reference to sustainability and international responsibility

We propose that the ‘purpose’ section of the framework should include a stronger and more concrete reference to the fact that we are part of and dependent on nature, and that the restoration of a healthy and safe natural environment should be a core purpose of the NPF. We believe that this is sufficiently important to receive its own dedicated statement (bullet point) in the ‘purpose’ section, which should also include a recognition of our international responsibility relating to the historical environmental impacts and colonial history.

Reference to future generations

We believe that it is important to be explicit that the purpose of the NPF is not only to ensure the wellbeing of people currently living in Scotland, but also the wellbeing of future generations. We therefore propose to change the bullet point on wellbeing to

- *increase the wellbeing of people living in Scotland now and in the future*

3-3 Changes to indicators and reporting

Increase clarity of reporting

We believe that the current website of indicators and reporting of progress against the National Outcomes is too complex and difficult to follow, with many measurements being out of date. It is difficult to understand what the indicators are actually showing. We therefore recommend overhauling the current presentation and choice of indicators to increase clarity and visual appeal and improve the frequency in reporting. In particular:

- More care is needed in the assessment of indicators as “improving” or “worsening”. For example, GHG emissions are considered as “improving” simply because they are declining. However, they are not declining fast enough to achieve the government’s climate targets and prevent climate breakdown. The assessment is therefore misleading. We recommend that for those indicators where it is appropriate that they are accompanied by a clear indication of time-bound targets.
- It would be helpful to show and acknowledge that many of the indicators are relevant to more than one National Outcome. For example, the indicators on carbon footprint and GHG emissions are allocated to the Economy Outcome but are equally relevant to the Environment Outcome. Equally, child mental health and material deprivation is relevant for both the Children and Young People Outcome as well as the Poverty Outcome. A more flexible presentation that would be able to show indicators related to more than outcome would help to provide more clarity and might also be a way to reduce the number of indicators needed.
- Choosing a small number of headline indicators for each outcome, sitting above, the wider set of indicators might help to make it easier to follow progress. The Wellbeing Economy Monitor could play a useful role here but it’s relationship to the NPF and its impact on decision making needs to be clarified.

Improving the measurement of poverty

A good understanding of poverty and the way is vital for creating a Wellbeing Economy in Scotland, especially an understanding that recognises that poverty is experienced very differently by different people. As the submission by The Poverty Alliance highlights, there are critical gaps in the data pertaining to the experiences of disabled people; single parents; Black and minority ethnic people; and young parents, as well as with regard to gender equality.²³ We therefore recommend a review of the set of indicators used to measure poverty that draws on the lived experience of those living in poverty. As a starting point we recommend the following changes:

- Address the data gaps with regard to equalities data
- Develop and make the best use of local data sources to ensure that poverty data reflects the local contexts and provides locally relevant information.

- Develop ways to take into account the distribution of resources within households. For example, increasing the income of a household might not necessarily reach all members of the household.
- Include a measure of material deprivation in adults to complement the one for children.
- Develop ways to effectively include qualitative data and lived experience in the measurement and understanding of poverty.

4 – Making the NPF and National Outcomes more impactful

The Scottish Government has committed to building a Wellbeing Economy and, as a founding member of the Wellbeing Economy Governments (WEGo) partnership, has played a leading role in the global movement to build a Wellbeing Economy. The statutory set of National Outcomes and the NPF are an important institutional tool for putting the wellbeing of people and planet at the heart of decision making in Scotland. Yet, despite some progress, Scotland’s economy still falls way short of delivering the National Outcomes and the goals of a Wellbeing Economy (see Section 1-1). In the following we outline a few ways through which the National Outcomes can be more deeply into decision making in Scotland, as similarly proposed by the Carnegie UK Trust.²⁴

4-1 Strengthen duties to promote NPF outcomes through a W&SD bill and provide clear guidance for implementation

We propose to strengthen the statutory basis of the National Outcomes and the NPF through the promised Wellbeing & Sustainable Development bill. The bill provides an important opportunity to create a unified approach to delivering Scotland’s National Outcomes, through relocating the National Outcomes into the bill and establish greater clarity for public bodies. Recent evidence²⁵ suggests that the existing duty on public bodies to “have regard to the National Outcomes”²⁶ is not strong enough to deliver its ambition. We believe that the duties to “promote sustainable development and wellbeing in policy development and implementation” is more positive and tangible than existing duties and will therefore improve the effectiveness of implementation.

In doing so the Bill will be able to bring clarity to the prioritisation and relationship between different duties in line with the principles of policy coherence for sustainable development to avoid false trade-offs and unintended consequences. Specifically, we recommend that the Bill should make clear that duties around sustainable development and wellbeing should be prioritised over duties to deliver economic growth where these exist.

In addition, we consider it important that the Bill strengthens duties placed on ministers to:

- demonstrate how National Outcomes support wellbeing and sustainable development in way that is coherent and supports policy coherence
- to support and facilitate active involvement of the public in the process of setting or revising National Outcomes
- report annually on the delivery of National Outcomes, with reference to both national statistics and the lived experience of the people of Scotland, to boost the status of the National Outcomes and enhance accountability
- to develop, and lay before Parliament, time-bound delivery plans for each National Outcome, including clarity over the policy and spending decisions taken to support

their implementation, and enhanced clarity over the timescales for delivering specified progress.

In order to be successful, it will be vital that public bodies are given clear guidance, sufficient support and the necessary tools to implement the strengthened duties. As set out above, the Commissioner can play an important role in this and there is scope to learn from other countries, such as New Zealand or Wales, who have made considerable progress in providing this kind of support.

4-2 Invest in a comprehensive participatory and deliberative process to increase legitimacy and ownership of the NPF across Scotland

As set out in this submission, we consider a strong wellbeing framework as an essential foundation for ensuring that decision making in Scotland is aligned with the needs of people and planet. But to represent a legitimate vision and compass for decision making in Scotland the National Outcomes and NPF need to be developed and revised in a much more democratic manner than has been done for past and current revisions.

We believe that the depth of future consultations should be increased to ensure the Outcomes fully and transparently, reflect the public's priorities and, crucially, build a sense of collective ownership over the resultant NPF. We ask the Scottish Government to increase the depth and scale of engagement, if not for this review, then by using this review as a springboard for sustained engagement over the next five years. Critically, this must appropriately reflect Scotland's demographics, including ensuring deeper engagement with children and young people reflecting the inter-generational importance of the National Outcomes, as well as with the voices of those at the sharp end of the current economic system. To increase trust in the process we recommend that fully disaggregated data on the engagement process is published.

Together with our partners in the 'Conversations for Scotland' project we are developing an approach for meaningfully engaging communities in the conversation about the Scotland that they want to see. We will report on the outcomes and potential for upscaling of this approach in a separate submission.

In addition to more meaningful and deeper participation of the public in the development and review of the NPF and National Outcomes, we also consider it important that the public has a much stronger role in the scrutiny of progress against the National Outcomes. We therefore propose the establishment of public panel of randomly selected citizens that regularly reviews the National Outcomes and progress towards and reports to parliament.

Finally, we consider it important that the current time period of 40 days for parliamentary consultation is extended to enable sufficient scrutiny of any proposed changes to the National Outcomes and the NPF.

4-3 Introduce Wellbeing Budgeting

To empower the NPF and National Outcomes to support better outcomes they need to be embedded into everyday decision making within the Scottish Government. The budget process can be a powerful starting point to do that.²⁷ Implementing a Wellbeing Budgeting approach would enable the government to assign priorities for spending by identifying specific shortfalls against the National Outcomes and to ensure that spending decisions are aligned with those

priorities. A Wellbeing Budgeting approach would also facilitate better cross-silo working to ensure that government spending is adequately tackling the root causes of problems and reducing failure demands.

Wellbeing budgeting approaches are being successfully pioneered in other countries, such as New Zealand and Canada and others.²⁷ We would encourage the Scottish Government to commit to implementing a Wellbeing Budget approach based on the learning and experience of these countries.

4-4 Create a Future Generations and Wellbeing Commissioner

We believe that the effectiveness and reach of the National Outcomes and NPF could be significantly improved by creating a Future Generations and Wellbeing Commissioner, for example as part of the Wellbeing & Sustainable Development Bill. Such a commissioner would provide crucial support for putting a coherent approach to wellbeing and sustainable development, expressed in the National Outcomes, at the heart of policymaking in Scotland:

- Aligning all decision making with the goals of achieving sustainable development and wellbeing through the National Outcomes can be a challenging task. Public bodies must be fully supported to understand, and then successfully implement, their responsibilities in progress the National Outcomes. The Commissioner could provide this support.
- The interests of future generations and those of the people across all parts of the globe are currently not well represented in Scottish democratic processes. The commissioner's role would be to give a voice to both current and future generations, living both here and elsewhere in the world, in the democratic processes of Scotland.
- The creation of a new Commissioner would also support a shift towards long-termism in policy making, with a particular focus on prevention. Current political structures reward short-term policy interventions, even when they incur future costs on health, the environment and so on. By bringing a future generations lens to decision making, a Commissioner could help to embed the principles of long-termism, and as such should be seen as an investment in prevention, not a cost.
- So far there is no body in Scotland with the capacity to independently scrutinise whether Scotland is making progress towards sustainable development, wellbeing and the National Outcomes and is creating the conditions for future generations to flourish. An important role of the Commissioner will be to hold public bodies to account for working towards these goals effectively.

In order to adequately support the success of the Bill we believe the Commissioner should:

- help to build the capacity of public bodies to implement their duties related to the National Outcomes and the wellbeing and sustainable development, including through the development and provision of tools, training, impact assessment methods, etc.
- monitor the implementation of those duties through scrutiny and investigative powers and report regularly to the Scottish Parliament.
- assess delivery of the National Outcomes for domestic and international policy coherence
- carry out research and provide advice to the Scottish Government, with this being published and publicly accessible.

- develop mechanisms to support public participation in scrutiny and decision-making for wellbeing, sustainable development and domestic and international policy coherence for sustainable development.
- pursue public engagement to raise awareness and build buy-in for the purpose of the legislation and to support civic participation in the development of wellbeing outcomes.

We believe that it is important for the title of the Commissioner to resonate with the public across Scotland in order for the Commissioner to provide visibility and accountability and to realise the full potential of the role. We therefore propose the following title for the role:

- *Future Generations and Wellbeing Commissioner for Scotland*

We know that the language of ‘future generations’ has greater appeal and relevance than some of the other terminology we use to describe public policy. We also consider it important to ensure that the focus of the role on the wellbeing of both future and current generations is clear.

We consider that the proposal will lead to a significant reduction in costs to public bodies, through promoting the prevention of harm and minimising the fiscal cost of failed policies. It is important to recognise that this legislation requires significant investment in order to be effective. It is likely that the office of a Future Generations Commissioner would demand a budget that is equivalent to that of the Children and Young People’s Commissioner for Scotland. The function of this office, however, would be to support policy development that reduces future costs, and we consider that the reductions in future costs will likely be significantly larger than the investment in the role of the Commissioner. A report by the Wellbeing Economy Alliance estimates that the Scottish and UK governments spend hundreds of millions of pounds each year on demands that could be avoided in a more preventatively designed economy.¹⁰ A report by Katherine Trebeck and Amy Baker and commissioned by Carnegie UK makes the fiscal argument for investing in early years and prevention as a way to avoid future costs – from healthcare costs (both mental and physical) to reduced tax revenue and higher welfare spending, and from criminal justice to demand for emergency services.²⁸

References

1. JRF, 2022. [Poverty in Scotland 2022](#).
2. STUC, 2020. The People's Recovery: [A different track for Scotland's economy](#).
3. Glasgow Centre for Population health 2023. [Changing mortality rates in Scotland and the UK: An updated summary](#)
4. IPCC, 2022. Climate Change 2022: [Impacts, Adaptation and Vulnerability: Summary for Policymakers](#)
5. WEAll Scotland 2022. [Redesigning our economy for people and planet: A joint statement from the movement for a Wellbeing Economy in Scotland](#).
6. Scotianomics 2020. [Public Attitude Toward Wellbeing Economics in Scotland](#)
7. Rutger Hoekstra, 2019. [Measuring the Wellbeing Economy: How to Go Beyond-GDP](#). Wellbeing Economy Alliance Briefing Paper.
8. Corlet Walker, C. and Jackson, T., 2019. [Measuring Prosperity: Navigating the Options](#). CUSP Working Paper Series No. 20.
9. Parrique et al. 2019. [Decoupling Debunked: Evidence and arguments against green growth as a sole strategy for sustainability](#). Brussels, Belgium: European Environmental Bureau.
10. Wellbeing Economy Alliance, 2021. [Failure Demand: Counting the true costs of an unjust and unsustainable economic system](#).
11. White, et al. 2023. [Tipping the Scales: The social and economic harm of poverty in Scotland](#). IPPR Scotland.
12. Michelle Meagher, 2020. *Competition is Killing US*. Penguin Random House UK
13. Gilmore et al., 2023. [Defining and conceptualising the commercial determinants of health](#). *The Lancet*.
14. Business Purpose Commission for Scotland, 2022. [Now is the time for purpose: Putting purpose at the heart of Scottish Business](#).
15. CLES - [The principles of Community Wealth Building](#)
16. Scottish Government, 2022. [Scotland's Carbon Footprint 1998-2018](#).
17. Centre for Thriving Places and Carnegie UK, 2022. [The shared ingredients for a Wellbeing Economy](#).
18. Stiglitz, J.E., Sen, A., Fitoussi, J.-P., 2009. [Report by the Commission on the Measurement of Economic Performance and Social Progress](#)
19. Scotland's Climate Assembly, 2021. [Recommendations for action](#).
20. Hickel, J. and Kallis, G. 2019. [Is Green Growth Possible? New Political Economy](#). 25(4), pp.469–486
21. Haberl et al., 2020. [A systematic review of the evidence on decoupling of GDP, resource use and GHG emissions. part II: synthesizing the insights](#). Environmental Research Letters. 15, article no: 065003
22. Otero et al. 2020. [Biodiversity policy beyond economic growth](#). Conservation Letters. 13(4), article no: e12713
23. The Poverty Alliance, 2023. [Submission to the Scottish Government Consultation on National Outcomes](#).
24. Carnegie UK, 2022. [National Performance Framework Next Steps](#).
25. Finance and Public Administration Committee, 2022. [Report on the National Performance Framework: Ambitions into Action](#).
26. Community Empowerment (Scotland) Act 2015.
27. Wellbeing Economy Alliance, forthcoming. Wellbeing Budgets: Treasuring what matters most.
28. Trebeck and Baker 2021. [Being Bold: Building Budgets for Children's Wellbeing](#). Carnegie UK Trust

This consultation response was prepared by Dr Lukas Bunse, Policy and Engagement Lead at WEAll Scotland. We are very grateful for the time and help provided by many of WEAll Scotland's allies and friends.

Appendix 1 - Detailed justification for a new Outcome on Care

Reproduced from the A Scotland That Cares Campaign

Why is a cross-cutting National Outcome on all forms of care needed?

Everyone needs care at some point in their life: as a child, in older age, or due to ill health or additional needs. This campaign, and the proposed National Outcome it calls for, therefore explicitly encompasses all forms of care – whether for adults or children, whether for those with or without additional support needs, and whether paid or unpaid. It encompasses the quality of the care experienced by individuals, and the quality of life this provides, as well as the physical, mental and financial wellbeing, including poverty, of those who provide care. The Covid-19 pandemic and the cost-of-living crisis have also deepened pre-existing challenges.^{1 2} The breadth and diversity of supporters of this campaign demonstrates the necessity for all forms of care to be fully considered within the creation of a new National Outcome on care, as well as the scale of support for its introduction as part of this five-yearly Review process.

The creation and subsequent pursuit of a new National Outcome on care would, over time, benefit everyone in Scotland, with virtually all of us experiencing or providing some form of care at some point in our lives. Estimates suggest there are 839,000 adult unpaid carers³ and approximately 29,000 young carers⁴. It would cost an estimated £10.9 billion every year to replace the care they provide.⁵ There are also 138,000 single parents with dependent children⁶ who experience additional pressures compared to other parents due to their caring responsibilities.

Care is also critical for delivering jobs in Scotland through both the early years and adult social care sectors. Social care alone already employs more than three times as many workers as agriculture, forestry, and fishing combined, with over 208,000 workers.⁷ This is only going to increase because of Scotland's ageing population and changing demographics. More widely, an estimated one in 25 people of all ages (231,925 people) were reported as receiving social care support and services at some point during 2020/21.⁸ It is therefore clear that care is the backbone of our society, without which the economy would grind to halt. Yet, care is systemically undervalued and is chronically underfunded.

The undervaluation of care, and lack of sufficient investment in it, impacts women the most because it is a deeply gendered issue. In Scotland, as many as 70% of unpaid carers are

¹ Carers Scotland, State of Caring in Scotland 2022 (7 November 2022):

<https://www.carersuk.org/reports/state-of-caring-in-scotland-2022/#:~:text=The%202022%20State%20of%20Caring,size%20in%20the%20survey's%20history>.

² One Parent Families Scotland, Living Without a Lifeline (2022): <https://opfs.org.uk/policy-and-campaigns/policy-research/living-without-a-lifeline/>

³ Scot Gov, National Care Service - Fairer Scotland Duty Assessment (21 June 2022):

<https://www.gov.scot/publications/national-care-service-fairer-scotland-duty-assessment/documents/>

⁴ Scot Gov, National Care Service – Child Rights and Wellbeing Impact Assessment (21 June 2022):

<https://www.gov.scot/publications/national-care-service-child-rights-wellbeing-impact-assessment/documents/>

⁵ Carers Scotland, State of Caring in Scotland 2022 (7 November 2022):

<https://www.carersuk.org/reports/state-of-caring-in-scotland-2022/#:~:text=The%202022%20State%20of%20Caring,size%20in%20the%20survey's%20history>.

⁶ ONS, Households by type of household and family (09 March 2022):

<https://www.ons.gov.uk/peoplepopulationandcommunity/birthsdeathsandmarriages/families/datasets/householdsbypetypeofhouseholdandfamilyregionsofenlandandukconstituentcountries>

⁷ Scottish Social Services Council, Scottish Social Service Sector: Report on 2021 Workforce Data (24 August 2022):

<https://data.sssc.uk.com/data-publications/22-workforce-data-report/295-scottish-social-service-sector-report-on-2021-workforce-data>

⁸ Scottish Government, people who access adult social care and unpaid carers: evidence (21 June 2022):

<https://www.gov.scot/publications/national-care-service-people-access-adult-social-care-unpaid-carers-scotland/>

women.⁹ Women also make up 96% of childcare¹⁰ and 80% of adult social care staff¹¹ – both sectors are characterised by low pay, poor working conditions, and job insecurity.¹² This unequal distribution of care work and its undervaluation can limit women’s economic prosperity and undermine their health and wellbeing.¹³

Gaps in our understanding exist, but the impacts of caring responsibilities can be more pronounced for people from minority ethnic backgrounds¹⁴, who are likely to do more hours of unpaid care work.¹⁵ Linked to this, women from minority ethnic backgrounds are also more likely to be economically inactive and in low paid jobs.¹⁶ At UK level, people from minority ethnic backgrounds are also over-represented in the child and adult social work workforces.¹⁷

What should a National Outcome on Care look like?

Academics at the University of the West of Scotland, conducting research as part of the UWS-Oxfam Partnership¹⁸, have worked with the ‘A Scotland that Cares’ campaign, to develop a [blueprint](#)¹⁹ for a new National Outcome on care. Published in November 2021, and adopting the format used for the existing set of National Outcomes, this research proposes a new National Outcome on care stating:

‘We fully value and invest in those experiencing care and all those providing it’.

Crucially, this research also identified seven ‘Beacon’ National Indicators, and a range of sub-indicators, which should be used to monitor progress, in addition to capturing people’s lived experience of care. These are:

1. **The quality of life of unpaid carers, care workers and those experiencing care**
 - E.g. right to breaks, access to mental health services, Life chances of young carers, Social connections, Life-care balance, Respite availability
2. **The quality of care for all**
 - E.g. Access and affordability of social care and childcare, Safety, Adequacy of the quality of care experienced, Support for unpaid carers
3. **The financial wellbeing of unpaid carers, care workers and those experiencing care**
 - E.g. % of care workers, unpaid carers and those experiencing care in poverty; Cost of care as a % of household income; Lifetime earnings gap; The length and

⁹ Scottish Government, Carers Census, Scotland, 2019-20 and 2020-21 (21 December 2021):

<https://www.gov.scot/publications/carers-census-scotland-2019-20-2020-21/pages/5/#~:text=Around%207%20in%2010%20carers,of%20unpaid%20carers%20were%20female>

¹⁰ Scottish Government, A Blueprint for 2020: Expansion of Early Learning and Childcare in Scotland Consultation (26 March 2020):

<https://www.gov.scot/publications/blueprint-2020-expansion-early-learning-childcare-scotland-consultation/pages/5/>

¹¹ Scot Gov, adult social care workforce: evidence (21 June 2022):

<https://www.gov.scot/publications/national-care-service-adult-social-care-workforce-scotland/documents/>

¹² Scottish Government, Adult social care: independent review (February 2021):

<https://www.gov.scot/publications/independent-review-adult-social-care-scotland/pages/3/>

¹³ Oxfam, C. Coffey, P. Espinoza Revollo, R. Harvey, M. Lawson, A. Parvez Butt, K. Piaget, D. Sarosi and J. Thekkudan. (2020). Time to Care: Unpaid and underpaid care work and the global inequality crisis, P29, Box 7 (January 2020):

<https://policy-practice.oxfam.org.uk/publications/time-to-care-unpaid-and-underpaid-care-work-and-the-global-inequality-crisis-620928>

¹⁴ UWS-Oxfam Partnership, Caring during the crisis: the experiences of ethnic minority communities in Scotland during COVID-19 (Feb 2023):

<https://oxfampartnership.uws.ac.uk/wp-content/uploads/2023/02/Report-No-12-Caring-during-crisis-the-experiences-of-ethnic-minority-communities-in-Scotland-during-COVID-19.pdf>

¹⁵ Scottish Government, National Care Service - adult social care: equality evidence review (21 June 2022):

<https://www.gov.scot/publications/national-care-service-adult-social-care-scotland-equality-evidence-review/pages/10/>

¹⁶ Fraser of Allander Institute, Economic outcomes for minority ethnic groups in Scotland (17 August 2020):

<https://fraserofallander.org/economic-outcomes-for-minority-ethnic-groups-in-scotland/>

¹⁷ What Works for Children’s Social Care, Ethnic Minority social workers in the UK (January 2022):

https://whatworks-csc.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/WWCSC_Ethnic_Minority_SW_Workforce_Rapid_Review_Jan22.pdf

¹⁸ UWS-Oxfam Partnership: <https://uwsoxfampartnership.org.uk/>

¹⁹ UWS-Oxfam Partnership, Towards a Scotland that cares A new National Outcome on care for the National Performance Framework (November 2021):

<http://uwsoxfampartnership.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/2021/11/NPF-Report.pdf>

level of paid maternity and paternity leave; % of unpaid carers who feel supported towards and within decent work

4. **The voice and influence of unpaid carers, care workers and those experiencing care**
 - E.g. Choice over the nature of care and how it is delivered (from those experiencing care); Care sectoral bargaining & worker voice; policy influence of carers
5. **Access to education and training**
 - E.g. % of people experiencing care in education; % of care workers in vocational training; % of unpaid carers in education; % of unpaid carers who have received care-based training
6. **The adequacy of funding for care**
 - E.g. adequacy of social security, level of funded childcare, funding for social care, funding for 3rd sector programmes
7. **The job quality of social care and childcare workers**
 - E.g. pay and conditions for care and childcare workers; holiday entitlement; overtime worked etc

We believe these Indicators and our proposed National Outcome statement should be further tested – particularly with those with direct experience of care – and improved if necessary. Work will also be needed to identify appropriate data sources, and to plug gaps where these exist. However, anything short of the range of issues covered in these proposed indicators would fall short of ensuring the dedicated new National Outcome on care properly measures progress on how we value and invest in all forms of care in Scotland. We provide further headline evidence across our draft indicators, detailing why more must be done to value and invest in care in Scotland in [this briefing](#).

Why Do We Need a New National Outcome?

Scotland's National Performance Framework (NPF), and the 11 National Outcomes that sit within it, is presented as Scotland's 'wellbeing framework'. While not perfect, we believe this evolving tool must emerge as a vital tool for driving forward Scotland's transition to a Wellbeing Economy, with care as a central component within it. Yet, care and carers – including parents and guardians of children, paid care workers, and unpaid carers for those with additional support needs – are nearly invisible in the 11 existing Outcomes.

Building a wellbeing economy is simply not possible without putting care at the centre of all we do, and this campaign demonstrates that this is increasingly being recognised. Clearly, there is no one policy solution in tackling the undervaluation of care, and this campaign recognises that fully valuing and investing in care in Scotland will require multiple changes across multiple areas, delivered at the same time.

As such, care should be fully considered within the delivery of every National Outcome. However, the lack of a dedicated Outcome fails to reflect the foundational importance of care to Scotland's society and economy or address the deep undervaluation of it. Until we shift our view on what we count as 'work' and centre the importance of paid and unpaid care, these changes will either not be made, or will not be made at the depth and scale needed to drive transformative change. Over time, a dedicated National Outcome, placed within an improved wellbeing framework, will help to change that by providing a strong focus for new, and sustained, policy and spending action at national and local levels. For example, it would reinforce the need for carers – of all types – to be considered more fully by local authorities

and public bodies, who are legally bound ‘to give due regard’ to the National Outcomes in carrying out their functions through the Community Empowerment (Scotland) Act 2015.²⁰ Critically, it will also enable us to meaningfully and transparently measure the progress achieved over time, using robust and cross-cutting indicators.

We know that a range of actions have been taken or are planned in Scotland that have the potential to improve how we value and invest in care – such as reforms to social security entitlement for unpaid carers²¹, additional investment²² and reforms to social care²³, and plans for developing an all-year-round school-age childcare system.²⁴ The creation of a National Outcome on care is not a substitute for these, or other immediate actions, with urgent progress essential across many areas.

However, a dedicated National Outcome on care will set a path towards ongoing and transformative change, and its introduction would place Scotland among the first countries in the world to make such an explicit commitment.²⁵

²⁰ Scottish Government, Community Empowerment (Scotland) Act 2015 (February 2017):

<https://www.gov.scot/publications/community-empowerment-scotland-act-summary/>

²¹ Scottish Government, Scottish Carers Assistance: consultation (28 February 2022):

<https://www.gov.scot/publications/scottish-carers-assistance-consultation/>

²² Scottish Government, Scottish Budget 2022-2023:

<https://www.gov.scot/binaries/content/documents/govscot/publications/corporate-report/2021/12/scottish-budget-2022-23/documents/scottish-budget-2022-23-level-4-data/scottish-budget-2022-23-level-4-data/govscot%3Adocument/scottish-budget-2022-23-level-4-data.xlsx>

²³ Scottish Government, Scottish Budget 2022-2023:

<https://www.gov.scot/binaries/content/documents/govscot/publications/corporate-report/2021/12/scottish-budget-2022-23/documents/scottish-budget-2022-23-level-4-data/scottish-budget-2022-23-level-4-data/govscot%3Adocument/scottish-budget-2022-23-level-4-data.xlsx>

²⁴ Scottish Government, Programme for Government 2022-23 (6 September 2022):

<https://www.gov.scot/publications/stronger-more-resilient-scotland-programme-government-2022-23/>

²⁵ UWS-Oxfam Partnership, Towards a Scotland that cares A new National Outcome on care for the National Performance Framework (November 2021):

<http://uwsoxfampartnership.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/2021/11/NPF-Report.pdf>